



Yearbook Evaluation

Yearbook Name _____ Year _____

Adviser's Name _____

School _____

To have your yearbook evaluated, it must be a current KEMPA member.

CATEGORY	TOTAL POINTS	
Theme (10 percent)	_____ /100	<input type="checkbox"/> ALL-KEMPA 900-1,000
Coverage (30 percent)	_____ /300	<input type="checkbox"/> FIRST PLACE 800-899
Writing (20 percent)	_____ /200	<input type="checkbox"/> SECOND PLACE 700-799
Design & Graphics (20 percent)	_____ /200	<input type="checkbox"/> THIRD PLACE 0-699
Photography (20 percent)	_____ /200	
Total	_____ /1,000	

OVERVIEW OF EVALUATION

This evaluation form is designed to provide a framework for the judge in evaluating the yearbook, to reward the staff for creativity and accomplishment and to provide suggestions for improvement for future books. We have tried to make this guide as open-ended as possible to allow the judge to consider all aspects of the yearbook and its audience.

KEMPA judges have earned a JEA Critique Training badge and are listed in JEA's national judging database. Scoring decisions are made against basic standards of scholastic journalism. Occasionally, staffs choose to ignore certain standards. That editorial decision is the privilege of the staff. In evaluating a publication, however, a judge cannot make scoring exceptions because the staff made a decision to follow a certain "tradition" of the school. The judge will score each yearbook against set standards.

A yearbook's evaluation is intended to be helpful, fair and well-substantiated.

If you have any concerns or comments about the scoring you received or suggestions for improvement of this scoring booklet, please contact KEMPA at KEMPAjournalism@gmail.com.

GENERAL INSTRUCTIONS TO THE JUDGE

Be sure to point out areas of excellence and let the staff know where they have excelled. Please use the space provided for suggestions and comments that will help the staff understand concerns and problem areas and how they might be improved.

If the yearbook is receiving a supercritique, write comments, directions, questions, arrows, etc. right on the yearbook **in addition to your notes on this form**. Return the yearbook to UW-Whitewater.

If you find evidence of plagiarism in an entry, reduce the score in that area with an explanation. Plagiarism and/or use of apparently copyrighted materials without permission will result in disqualification from receiving an ALL-KEMPA rating.

If you have questions, please contact KEMPA at KEMPAjournalism@gmail.com.

Kettle Moraine Press Association
UW-Whitewater
800 W. Main St., Roseman 2005
Whitewater, WI 53190
262-472-1691

Acknowledgements

All KEMPA publications are critiqued by non-member judges located in geographic areas outside of Wisconsin and Illinois.

THEME

STANDARD: Staff has created an exemplary publication in the area of theme development. The staff obviously understands the need to provide readers with elements that enhance readability of the publication.

THEME DEVELOPMENT

- The book's theme is obvious, a natural extension of the year's events and issues. The concept is unique and fresh. The theme gives the book a distinctive personality.
- The front cover includes the name of the book, the year and the theme. The cover's spine includes the name of the book, the name of the school, the city and state, the year and the volume number.
- The title page includes the name of the book, the year, the name of the school, the complete school address, the school's phone number, the school's population and the volume number.
- The table of contents is located on the front end-sheet or opening pages of the book.
- The opening theme copy includes specific examples from this school
- The table of contents is located on the front end-sheet or opening pages of the book.
- The opening theme copy includes specific examples from this school year only and explains how the theme applies to this school and this year only.
- All division spreads include theme copy, and this copy is specific to this year only.
- The closing is located at the end of the book, after advertising and index. The closing copy includes specific examples from this year only.
- All theme spreads include headlines that reinforce the theme's concept. If printed, the endsheets support and promote the book's theme.
- Photographs on the title page, opening, division pages, closing (and cover/endsheets, if applicable) promote the book's theme. Captions are provided for those photos, and they promote the book's theme.
- The design of the theme pages is contemporary, eye-catching and unlike designs in other parts of the book.
- Division page design is similar but not identical to the design of the opening and closing.

Theme Strengths:

Theme Recommendations:

Score for Theme

0 60 70 80 100
Needs improvement Average/Good Very Good Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 100.

COVERAGE

STANDARD: Coverage is complete and thorough and helps to tell the story of the school year in both words and photos. Staff indicates an obvious awareness of coverage ideals. Staff approaches coverage with an emphasis on the unique and unusual.

GENERAL

- The staff made a concerted effort to cover as many people as possible throughout the yearbook; the staff avoided quoting or picturing the same people again and again.
- Theme copy incorporates specific events, facts, trends and people that made this year unique.
- All copy, photos, captions and headlines work together to cover a wide variety of activities, events, facts, trends and people that made the year unique.
- Through student life, sports, people and academics, the book covers a 12-month period, not just the school year.
- Theme coverage includes a table of contents, title page, opening spread(s), division spreads and closing(s) spreads that present the theme, show how it applies to the year and is specific in nature.

General Coverage Strengths:

General Coverage Recommendations:

SPORTS COVERAGE

- All sports have been given fair coverage.
- Varsity, junior varsity, and freshman levels have been covered fairly.
- Schools without competitive team sports provide stories on intramurals and/or individual sports and leisure activities.
- Photos and copy cover athletes fairly; photos are action-oriented but also include sideline activities.
- Copy uses featurized approach and avoids rehashing the entire season; focuses on the most memorable or exciting aspects of the season, record-setting events, etc.; copy avoids predictions for next season.
- Post-season events receive adequate coverage.
- Copy avoids editorializing and instead uses quotes from a variety of people to express opinions; writers are objective and non-apologetic.
- Each team's season is accurately presented through scoreboards that include team scores and final season's records; scoreboards appear on each sport's spread.
- All sports captions tell the entire story of the pictures, including contests' scores, individual scores (if applicable), all player's names.

Sports Coverage Recommendations:

COVERAGE, cont.

Sports Coverage Recommendations:

STUDENT LIFE COVERAGE

- The Student Life section (or coverage in a chronological book) covers a variety of events and activities, both inside and outside the regular school day; this section comprises 18-22% of the book, excluding the index and advertising sections.
- Coverage reflects events beyond the school, into the community, the state, the nation and the world. (These topics may appear in other areas of the book.)
- Organization of this section is logical, lively and interesting, and appeals to a wide variety of interests.
- The yearbook covers a 12-month period; coverage appears in both copy and photos.

Student Life Coverage Strengths:

Student Life Coverage Recommendations:

ACADEMIC COVERAGE

- All academic areas have been covered.
- The Academic section/pages comprises 10-12% of the book, excluding the index and advertising sections.
- Photos and copy reflect a variety of classroom activities, with a focus on what was new or different in each academic area.
- Copy is student-oriented and tells the story of the academic year, using specific examples, photos, activities, events and quotes; field trips and other out-of-school academic events are covered

Academic Coverage Strengths:

Academic Coverage Recommendations:

COVERAGE, cont.

CLUB & ORGANIZATION COVERAGE

- All clubs and organizations are covered; the section comprises 12-15% of the book, not including the index and advertising sections.
- Action photos dominate each spread and show members involved in meaningful club related activities.
- Copy focuses on new/unique events of the year, avoids purposes/goals, avoids listing members/officers, includes significant quotes and facts and remains objective.

Club & Organization Coverage Strengths:

Club & Organization Coverage Recommendations:

PEOPLE COVERAGE

- The People section/pages comprises about 25% of the book, excluding index and advertising sections.
- Feature stories or alternative copy appears on each spread and includes significant quotes; stories cover a wide range of topics appropriate to the section.
- Portrait identification is given with first names first.
- Staff has made an effort to include all students, faculty and support staff; if individuals are not pictured, their names are listed at the end of appropriate section. (No black boxes to represent missing individuals or comments such as "camera shy.")
- Items such as senior predictions, superlatives, quotes, and wills are omitted; if included, senior summaries appear in the senior section or with seniors' index entries.

People Coverage Strengths:

People Coverage Recommendations:

Score for Coverage

0	100	150-200	250	300
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 300.

WRITING

☑ **STANDARD:** Reporting supplements the photographic action in the book. Each spread includes a specific and complete report. Reporting demonstrates quality writing skills by student staff members. Reporting is free of typos, spelling errors and grammatical mistakes.

BODY COPY

- Body copy has been included on all spreads including people section, advertising, and index. (Body copy may include traditional stories, as well as alternative approaches.)
- In most cases, body copy is written in past tense. (Personality features may use present tense.) Tense remains consistent within stories.
- Copy is written in the third person and is consistent within stories. (Theme copy may vary in person)
- Pronouns agree in number with antecedents (team/its; players/they).
- Punctuation is used correctly, including commas, colons, quotation marks and apostrophes.
- Sentences and paragraphs are kept short.
- Writers use appropriate summary or feature leads which are generally one sentence in length; writers avoid question and quote leads.
- Copy is lively, interesting and well written, using strong verbs and nouns.
- Copy includes many direct quotes from a variety of appropriate sources.
- Copy is based on good interviewing and first-person reporting and avoids the writer's opinions.
- Writers have made an effort to find new ways to cover topics and events, have avoided the phrase *this year*, and have focused on this year only.
- The staff has consistently used stylebook rules for titles, names, numbers, dates, title and scores.
- Winning scores are always listed first.
- Titles are used in the identification of all adults, although courtesy titles are not required, based on each school's style rules.
- Individuals are identified with first and last names and appropriate titles on the first mention.
- Theme copy is well written, explains how the theme applies to the year and includes specific information about the people and events of the year.
- A complete index appears near the end of the book; all people, sports, major events, activities, clubs and student life topics are included in the index.
- The index includes copy and candid photos; point size is readable but not too large.
- Advertising pages, if present, include copy and candid photos; display ads vary in size.

Body Copy Strengths:

Body Copy Recommendations:

WRITING, cont.

CAPTIONS

- Complete captions have been included for every photograph (not portraits) in the book.
- Captions include two or more sentences and may also include direct quotes.
- The first sentence, describing the photo's action, is written in present tense. Additional sentences are written in past tense and provide other pertinent information related to the photo.
- Captions provide the complete names of all people pictured, including opponent athletes.
- Writers use consistent style with regard to titles and class designations.
- Captions answer who, what, when, where, why, and how and avoid stating the obvious.
- Captions do not include the opinion of the writer.
- Gag captions are never used.
- Identification of group photos include identification of rows (Front Row, Second Row, Back Row)..
- Identification of group shots includes first and last names, titles for adults/officers/team captains.
- Captions and group identifications omit phrases such as from left to right; people are identified from left to right.

Captions Strengths:

Captions Recommendations:

HEADLINES

- Headlines identify the page content but are more than just a label of the team, topic or group.
- Headlines incorporate both attention-getting feature headlines and summary headlines, using a variety of point sizes or other techniques for visual appeal.
- Each copy block has its own headline.
- Sentence headlines use present tense; feature headlines are capitalized appropriately.
- Headlines fill the allotted space and use correct punctuation.

Headlines Strengths:

Headlines Recommendations:

Score for Writing

0	100	140	170	200	
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent	

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 200.

DESIGN & GRAPHICS

☑ **STANDARD:** News publication shows staff understanding of basic design concepts with graphic accent. Pages reveal unity of purpose with balance, dominance and perspective. Design helps communicate the message of the coverage without dominating that message. Design is clean, clear and appealing.

OVERALL DESIGN

- Each section has its own column/grid plan and elements follow plan consistently.
- Placement of elements varies from spread to spread within each section (variety).
- Captions are next to, above, or below the photos they identify.
- Designer has, when possible, avoided clustering or numbering captions and has stacked no more than two captions.
- Each spread contains a copy block with a headline. Any sidebars have a similar headline style. Copy may be traditional or alternative story forms.
- Page margins are consistent within sections.
- Facing pages are treated as a unit, and there is a pleasing balance of white space, photos and copy, with white space and copy typically towards the outside of the page/layout.
- Spreads typically contain 5-7 candid photos. Spreads using additional photos are panelized or modular in layout.
- Every spread contains a dominant element that is 2 –2 1/2 times larger than other photos on the spread; there is a variety of rectangular shapes on all spreads. Odd-shaped photos are avoided or used with design restraint.
- There is consistent spacing between elements. (Designers may use isolated elements or contemporary negative spacing without deduction,)
- The book's cover is appealing, contemporary; it introduces and harmonizes with the book's theme; cover material is durable and attractive.
- End sheets, if printed, continue the visual ideas of the theme and harmonize with the cover; the table of contents may appear on the front endsheets.

Overall Design Strengths:

Overall Design Recommendations:

DESIGN & GRAPHICS, cont.

GRAPHICS

- Graphics are planned extensively, and not used for their own sake but to enhance the story.
- An infographic contains illustrations or graphics to represent and visually interpret the facts and figures within. Infographics should include source(s), a headline, an explanation and designer credit.
- Alternative story forms feature strong, creative visual elements relevant to the story being told.
- Designers have utilized “quick-read” elements for the reader.
- Color and gray tones have been used effectively.
- Artwork is professional in appearance and contemporary; graphic elements are contemporary and logically go with the theme. If photos are used on the cover/endsheets, they promote the book’s theme.

Graphics Strengths:

Graphics Recommendations:

Score for Design & Graphics

0	100	140	170	200
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 200.

PHOTOGRAPHY

STANDARD: Photography throughout the publication indicates staff has an awareness of the critical role quality photography plays in journalism. Sound composition and strong technical quality are apparent throughout the yearbook with few lapses. Photographers use exposure, reporting and camera skills to give readers an artistic portrait of the school's year.

PHOTOGRAPHY

- All photos are in focus, show proper contrast, and have a center of visual interest.
- Staff has chosen candid photos that tell the story of the year; staff avoids posed and smile-at-the-camera photos; baby pictures and then-and-now pictures have been avoided (except in the case of grad ads).
- Photos have been cropped effectively; photos do not face off the page; dominant photos have been used and have been chosen wisely.
- Candid, not group photos, are the dominant photos on the spreads.
- Group photos are arranged in orderly rows with neutral backgrounds, have been cropped appropriately and have omitted props such as balls, bats, pompoms, musical instruments, etc.
- Head sizes in group shots are large enough to recognize students; extremely large group shots have been avoided by breaking large groups into two or more smaller groups.
- All formal portraits have consistent head sizes, lighting, and backgrounds. Backgrounds are plain. Conservative poses are used, omitting suggestive poses, angles, profiles, tilts, animals, flowers, etc.
- The staff has included photos of the school and community to provide a historical view.
- The staff has included a wide range of activity and action photos; sports photos emphasize competition interaction but also provide sideline and reaction shots.
- Photos show a variety of shots, including close-up and medium range shots; staff has avoided photos that do not contain people.

Photography Strengths:

Photography Recommendations:

Score for Photography

0 100 140 170 200
Needs improvement Average/Good Very Good Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 200.

--

SUMMARY COMMENTS

Judge's Signature _____
Type name if completing evaluation electronically.

Thank you for evaluating student media for the Kettle Moraine Press Association!