



Magazine Evaluation

Magazine Name _____ Year _____

Adviser's Name _____

School _____

To have your magazine evaluated, it must be a current KEMPA member.

CATEGORY	TOTAL POINTS	
Coverage and Content (20 percent)	_____ /200	<input type="checkbox"/> ALL-KEMPA 900-1,000
Writing and Editing (30 percent)	_____ /300	<input type="checkbox"/> FIRST PLACE 800-899
Design and Graphics (25 percent)	_____ /250	<input type="checkbox"/> SECOND PLACE 700-799
Photography (15 percent)	_____ /150	<input type="checkbox"/> THIRD PLACE 0-699
Leadership (10 percent)	_____ /100	
Total	_____ /1,000	

OVERVIEW OF EVALUATION

This evaluation form is designed to provide a framework for the judge in evaluating the magazine, to reward the staff for creativity and accomplishment and to provide suggestions for improvement for future issues. We have tried to make this guide as open-ended as possible to allow the judge to consider all aspects of the magazine and its audience.

KEMPA judges have earned a JEA Critique Training badge and are listed in JEA's national judging database. Scoring decisions are made against basic standards of scholastic journalism. Occasionally, staffs choose to ignore certain standards. That editorial decision is the privilege of the staff. In evaluating a publication, however, a judge cannot make scoring exceptions because the staff made a decision to follow a certain "tradition" of the school. The judge will score each magazine against set standards.

A publication's evaluation is intended to be helpful, fair and well-substantiated.

If you have any concerns or comments about the scoring you received or suggestions for improvement of this scoring booklet, please contact KEMPA at KEMPAjournalism@gmail.com.

GENERAL INSTRUCTIONS TO THE JUDGE

Be sure to point out areas of excellence. Please use the space provided for suggestions and comments that will help the staff understand concerns and problem areas and how they might be improved. Judges should take into account that magazines may be news- or feature-focused.

If the magazine is receiving a supercritique, write comments, directions, questions, arrows, etc. right on the magazine **in addition to your notes on this form**. Return the magazines to UW-Whitewater.

If you find evidence of plagiarism in an entry, reduce the score in that area with an explanation. Plagiarism and/or use of apparently copyrighted materials without permission will result in disqualification from receiving an ALL-KEMPA rating.

If you have questions, please contact KEMPA at KEMPAjournalism@gmail.com.

Kettle Moraine Press Association
UW-Whitewater
800 W. Main St., Roseman 2005
Whitewater, WI 53190
262-472-1691

Acknowledgements

KEMPA thanks the Kansas Scholastic Press Association and the Michigan Interscholastic Press Association for allowing us to borrow items from their critique booklets.

All KEMPA publications are critiqued by non-member judges located in geographic areas outside of Wisconsin and Illinois.

COVERAGE & CONTENT

☒ **STANDARD:** Coverage and content is broad and varied to address issues of interest at the school using both words and photos. Staff showcases an awareness of coverage options with an emphasis on the factual, unique and compelling. Individual issues may be thematically focused on a single topic.

NEWS AND/OR FEATURE COVERAGE

- The publication attempts to reach the whole school community, is comprehensible to outside readers and emphasizes materials of interest and consequence to most students.
- The publication appears lively, entertaining, enterprising and well-balanced. It incorporates current trends appropriate to readers in its community.
- Significant issues, especially social concerns, are explored as news analysis, enterprise, investigative or special topic reporting. Local or campus tie-ins are evident.
- Features are stimulating, interesting, entertaining and/or timely, and may include some or all of these types: human interest, informative, instructional, personality.
- Minority groups and diversity issues within a school or community are presented.
- Stories are written with thorough reporting. When applicable, at least three sources have been used.
- The staff may cover subjects of controversy and impact within the school.
- A balance of briefs and detailed accounts occur in the publication.
- Personality profiles offer realistic, newsworthy portrayals.
- Puzzles, jokes and humor elements are permissible but limited. Horoscopes and gossip columns are omitted.
- Polls/surveys emphasize summary results and indicate size and range of sampling and timeliness.

News and/or Feature Coverage Strengths:

News and/or Feature Coverage Recommendations:

Score for Coverage

0	100	140	170	200
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 200.

--

WRITING AND EDITING

☑ **STANDARD:** Reporting is authoritative, trustworthy and clearly stated. Student staff members demonstrate quality writing and research skills. Writing is free of typos, style mistakes, spelling errors and grammatical oversights.

BASIC PRINCIPLES

- All writing, with the exception of editorials, opinion columns and analysis, is free of the writer's/reporter's opinions.
- Stories include a sufficient number of appropriate sources to make coverage fair and accurate. Reporters make a sincere attempt to interview the most knowledgeable sources.
- Story leads are concise, capture the reader's attention and feature important facts, opinions or unusual angles. Some leads may include second person pronouns.
- Journalistic writing style is consistent, whether AP or other style, and appropriate to story topic with third person point of view and active voice verb dominating.
- Staff editorials are written in the third person; opinion columns in the first person; analysis, clearly labeled, in first, second or third person. An exception to this, the narrative form, may be written in the first person.
- Paragraphs vary in length and are usually short. Successive paragraphs in a story do not repeat same words in the beginning. Sentences are clear, varied.
- Fairness is crucial. All sides of controversial issues are covered. Accuracy is stressed.
- People are completely identified in a consistent style.
- Stories are edited and proofed carefully to check spelling, the accuracy of numbers and other facts, sentence structure, subject-verb agreement, grammar, usage and syntax.

Basic Principles Strengths:

Basic Principles Recommendations:

STORIES IN GENERAL

- Transitions are evident in stories.
- Stories reflect sound interviewing and quotes are used effectively.
- Stories provide sufficient background and context for the reader.
- Quotes are used effectively to move the story
- Feature story topics are varied, original and thoroughly researched.
- Sports writers use colorful style but objective straight reporting. Columns are not preachy.
- Sports stories avoid clichés and jargon.
- Opposing teams and coaches are interviewed and their viewpoints included in sports stories.
- Sports leads avoid combining team name, school name or nickname and/or sport name.

WRITING AND EDITING, cont.

Stories in General Strengths:

Stories in General Recommendations:

HEADLINES, CAPTIONS

- Headlines attract readers' attention and emphasize accuracy and summary.
- Headlines avoid overuse of school name, abbreviations, repetitions, split-infinitives, separation of adverbs and adjectives from verbs and nouns, separation of preposition from object.
- Varied styles of headlines can and should be used.
- The caption's first sentence is in present tense and the remaining sentence(s) in past tense. Captions avoid clichéd phrases. All people are identified. A caption appears with each photo.
- Captions say more than what is obvious in the photo. They answer who, what, when, where, why and how.
- Captions avoid "pictured above," "poses for the camera," "left to right."
- All photos and art are credited.

Headlines/Captions Strengths:

Headlines/Captions Recommendations

Score for Writing and Editing

0	100	200	225	250	300
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent	

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 300.

--

DESIGN & GRAPHICS

☑ **STANDARD:** The magazine shows staff understanding of basic design concepts with graphic accent. Pages reveal unity of purpose with balance, dominance and perspective. Design helps communicate the message of the coverage without dominating that message. Design is clean, clear and appealing.

OVERALL DESIGN

- Pages are well-balanced with a dominant element. Other visual items are used to help the reader navigate the page.
- A photo or piece of art should not separate a story from its headline
- Column widths are appropriate, not too wide or too narrow, optimally no wider than 39 characters.
- Longer blocks of text are broken up with subheads, lead-ins, pull quotes and other devices that minimize gray space (solid blocks of text).
- Captions are set in a contrasting or sans serif typeface.
- Leading is appropriate and kerning is minimally used when necessary.
- Design is creative and all elements work together to tell each story.
- White space is purposeful. Internal margins are consistent. At least an “em” space surrounds type that is boxed and surrounds the boxes themselves..
- Rules, dingbats, typographic devices are used to enhance or support content, not overwhelm or take away from information.
- Opening pages include a message from the editor, the masthead, and table of contents.
- Folios appear on all pages and include publication name, page numbers and issue identification.
- Column logos, bylines and standing heads are consistent throughout and well-designed.

Overall Design Strengths:

Overall Design Recommendations:

DESIGN & GRAPHICS, cont.

GRAPHICS

- Graphics are planned extensively, and not used for their own sake but to enhance the story.
- An infographic contains illustrations or graphics to represent and visually interpret the facts and figures within. Infographics should include source(s), a headline, an explanation and designer credit.
- Editorial/opinion cartoons, when used, convey the message simply with little text needed.
- Alternative story forms feature strong, creative visual elements relevant to the story being told.
- Designers utilize “quick-read” elements for the reader.
- Color and gray tones have been used effectively.

Graphics Strengths:

Graphics Recommendations:

TYPOGRAPHY

- Typography provides effective contrast so that individual pieces of coverage are distinct.
- The staff avoids the use of overly decorative typefaces that draw attention to themselves.
- A consistent style for headlines is used.
- Typographical points of entrance such as large initial letters, pulled quotes and fact boxes have been effectively incorporated.

Typography Strengths:

Typography Recommendations:

Score for Design & Graphics

0	100	150	200	250
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 250.

--

PHOTOGRAPHY

✓ **STANDARD:** Photography throughout the publication indicates staff has an awareness of the critical role quality photography plays in journalism. Sound composition and strong technical quality are apparent throughout the magazine with few lapses.

PHOTOGRAPHY

- Photos are carefully selected for maximum reader interest and reproduction quality.
- Photos are cropped to the center of interest and the center of interest is focused.
- Elements of composition are incorporated to create artistic photos that fulfill journalistic story-telling expectations.
- Content of photos is newsworthy, significant or unusual and is of relevance to the audience.
- A variety of photos — action, mugs, groups, objects — is published. When appropriate, photo coverage of news and athletic events is included.
- Photos are free of technical flaws while shooting and are not overly repaired in an editing program.
- Photo cutouts are executed well and are appropriate to the design of the story.
- Photos have been adjusted for proper contrast.
- Overall crisp appearance of photos eliminates pixelation and distortion through stretching.
- Photos from outside sources are credited properly.

Photography Strengths:

Photography Recommendations:

Score for Photography

0	75	100	125	150
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 150.

--

LEADERSHIP

☒ **STANDARD:** The magazine demonstrates awareness and energy for using printed words and images to lead readers. Editors clearly value freedom of expression granted by the First Amendment.

LEADERSHIP

- The magazine may express concern for the well-being of the school, students, staff and faculty or the community through commentary in editorials and opinion columns.
- There is evidence of thorough research covering all aspects of the topics being covered.
- There is a mix of coverage of non-school events and issues relevant to students that will make students well-informed citizens.
- The magazine attempts to cover topics and issues of concern and interest to its main audience.
- The cover of the magazine contains information that is most significant of the content within the publication.
- The magazine furnishes students with information of immediate and long-range effects on students' lives.
- Editorials/opinions provide leadership through responsible comment on a wide range of subjects. Issues include at least one editorial/opinion based on a timely important topic covered elsewhere in the publication.
- Editorials reflect thorough research and suggest, when possible, solutions

Leadership Strengths:

Leadership Recommendations:

PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND ETHICS

- Students follow ethical practices, accept professional standards and adhere to press law.
- Students use accepted journalistic forms and style. Any deviation is made because it is appropriate and valuable to readers.
- Fairness is crucial. All sides of controversial issues are covered. Accuracy is stressed.
- The magazine is professional and journalistic in its approach to coverage, writing and leadership.

Professional Standards and Ethics Strengths:

Professional Standards and Ethics Recommendations:

Score for Leadership

0	60	70	80	100
Needs improvement		Average/Good	Very Good	Excellent

Judges: The numbers above are just markers. You may give any number of points up to 100.

--

SUMMARY COMMENTS

Judge's Signature _____

Type name if completing evaluation electronically.

Thank you for evaluating student media for the Kettle Moraine Press Association!